



To the General Manager

Attach:

1. Traffic Count and Speed Map
2. Bannerman Street Traffic Calming Plan

SUBJECT: (4.2) Bannerman Street, Cremorne – Traffic calming review

AUTHOR: Report of Sustainable Transport Projects Coordinator, Lindsay Menday

DESCRIPTION/SUBJECT MATTER:

At its meeting of 25 February 2019, Council resolved to adopt a recommendation of the North Sydney Traffic Committee relating to the installation of trial speed cushions in Bannerman Street, Cremorne, as follows:

THAT the matter be delegated to the Manager Traffic and Transport Operations for a 3-month trial period of the rubber speed cushioning to be put in place and monitored, and at the end of the trial it come back to the committee to determine whether the speed cushions should be permanently replaced with asphalt cushions at the end of their life.

The speed cushion installation was completed on 21 September 2019 and Council invited feedback during the trial until 2 February 2020. The feedback from the community indicated that while the cushions were effective in reducing speed, there is community concern around the number of drivers swerving to avoid the cushions and relating to the perceived ‘discomfort’ or ‘impact’ when traversing the cushions.

Additionally, at the Council meeting on 26 August 2019 it was resolved (Min. 241):

THAT subject to Traffic Committee concurrence, upgrades to the Bannerman Street, Cremorne Pedestrian Crossing (Option 1 – Raising the existing crossing above road level) be constructed within the 2019/20 Financial Year.

Subsequently at the Traffic Committee meeting on 22 November 2019, the Traffic Committee recommended (Min. 85):

THAT the raising of the existing road level pedestrian crossing over Bannerman Street near to the intersection with Murdoch Street above road level (TDA 19/126) be deferred till until after the speed bump cushion trial has been completed.

In response to the feedback received during the consultation it is proposed to:

1. Remove the trial speed cushions and;
2. Install two (2) full width 75mm high ‘flat top’ thresholds where the two most westerly sets of cushions are located, such that drivers are not able to ‘drive around’ the speed calming device and;

3. Raise the pedestrian crossing near to the intersection with Murdoch Street as previously resolved by Council (EPS05 26/8/19 – Min. 241). This is likely to have a traffic calming effect in this part of the street, and therefore remove the need to construct a threshold in the location of the third trial cushion closest to Murdoch Street, while also potentially improving pedestrian safety, and;

RECOMMENDATION:

1. **THAT** the trial speed cushions on Bannerman Street be removed as soon as possible.
2. **THAT** that two (2) low profile flat top thresholds be constructed in Bannerman Street in the locations of the two most westerly trial cushions (i.e. furthest two locations from Murdoch Street).
3. **THAT** Council proceed with raising the crossing over Bannerman Street near to the intersection with Murdoch Street as resolved by Council at its meeting of 26 August 2019.

DETAIL

Standard or Guideline Used: Austroads.

Signs & Lines Priority: 2

Precinct and Ward: Hayes, Victoria.

Impact on Bicycles: The proposed flat top thresholds can be negotiated by people riding.

Impact on Pedestrians: Reduced vehicle speeds in the street are likely to improve pedestrian safety and amenity. The location of the proposed flat top thresholds does not interfere with any pedestrian areas

Impact on Parking: All existing parking will be retained. Vehicles will be permitted to continue to park on top of the proposed flat top thresholds in the parking lane.

At its meeting of 25 February 2019, Council resolved to adopt the following recommendation of the North Sydney Traffic Committee relating to the installation of trial speed cushions in Bannerman Street, Cremorne:

THAT the matter be delegated to the Manager Traffic and Transport Operations for a 3-month trial period of the rubber speed cushioning to be put in place and monitored, and at the end of the trial it come back to the committee to determine whether the speed cushions should be permanently replaced with asphalt cushions at the end of their life.

COMMUNITY FEEDBACK

The speed cushions were installed on 21 September 2019 and feedback was invited until 2 February 2020. At the time of writing, Council has received 86 submissions from 83 submitters via Council's 'your say' page (some respondents made multiple submissions). Approximately 90% of the comments received either indicated a preference for the cushions not to be installed on a permanent basis or otherwise raised issues with the cushions. Key issues raised in the submissions are summarised in the table below.

No. Submissions	Issue	Comment
41	<p>Road safety concerns relating to drivers manoeuvring into cycle lane or car parking lane to avoid cushions or slowing abruptly on approach to the cushions (approx. 47% of submissions).</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p><i>Drivers move into bicycle lanes or opposite side of road to avoid them</i></p> <p><i>I am not in favour of the speed cushions....I have also observed many cars swerve along the roads to avoid going over the cushion</i></p> <p><i>I have almost been rear ended twice in two days on the newly installed speed cushions</i></p> <p><i>I've noticed cars avoiding the speed</i></p>	<p>Site observations confirmed that some drivers are leaving the travel lane to avoid the cushions.</p> <p>Around 20 – 25% of those who raised this concern further commented that full width traffic calming would address this issue.</p> <p>Full width thresholds are proposed to mitigate this concern.</p>

No. Submissions	Issue	Comment
	<p><i>cushions by repeatedly swerving into bicycle lane. It probably forced them to slow down, but it's unsafe for cyclists.</i></p>	
18	<p>Concern that impact when crossing speed cushions was injuring vehicle occupants/creating discomfort/damaging vehicles (approx. 20% of submissions)</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p><i>Motorists and passengers with bad backs get a painful jolt when going over the multiple speed cushions which are located close together.</i></p> <p><i>They are not 'cushions' but extremely solid and jarring in material and design which does no good to our vehicles or our spinal comfort</i></p> <p><i>it doesn't matter how slow you go over them they are still very uncomfortable</i></p> <p><i>The trial 'cushions' are brutally hard on car suspensions and tyres</i></p>	<p>Full width flat top thresholds proposed in this report are constructed with longer approach/departure ramps that offer a smoother transition than cushions.</p>
8	<p>The cushions reduce speeds (approx. 10% of submissions)</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p><i>The speed cushions appear to have slowed down the speed of vehicles in Bannerman Street</i></p> <p><i>They have now slowed the traffic too much</i></p>	<p>Full width 'flat top' thresholds proposed in this report are also anticipated to provide a traffic calming effect.</p> <p>The installation of a raised pedestrian crossing in place of the existing road level crossing at the intersection between Bannerman Street and Murdoch Street as proposed in this report is anticipated to contribute to reduced speeds in the street, thus reducing the need for a threshold in the closest location to Murdoch Street.</p>

No. Submissions	Issue	Comment
8	<p>The cushions generate increased noise or other environmental impacts (approx. 10% of submissions)</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p><i>The constant "da doonk" sound is awful</i></p> <p><i>the speed humps are quite harsh and force drivers to slow down to 20km which produces more pollution in the forms of brake dust and noise for the local area and residents.</i></p>	<p>Full width ‘flat top’ thresholds proposed in this report thresholds are likely to generate less noise as they allow a smoother transition than cushions.</p>
7	<p>Support for the cushions as they improve road safety (approx. 10% of submissions)</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p><i>The speed humps installed in Bannerman street over the past 3-4 weeks have been an extraordinary forward step. MY THANKS...this has radically increased the safety of the street for everyone; residents, those attempting to cross; and indeed those who used to speed down the street</i></p>	<p>Full width ‘flat top’ thresholds proposed in this report are also intended to achieve similar traffic calming outcomes.</p>

Table 1. Summary of comments received on the Bannerman Street speed cushions

Council also received feedback outside of the ‘Your Say’ page, by phone and email which generally mirrored the above feedback. Those giving phone feedback were encouraged to also register their comments via the ‘Your Say’ page.

The feedback on the trial has indicated that the speed cushions are not broadly supported by the community and that people are particularly concerned about the extent to which drivers have been manoeuvring around the cushions. In this context, it is considered appropriate to remove the cushions now that the trial period is concluded. As speeding in Bannerman Street has been raised as an issue over a period of time (further detail is provided in an earlier report on this matter available on the following page

(https://www.northsydney.nsw.gov.au/Council_Meetings/Meetings/Council_Meetings/Council_Reports_27_Aug_2018), it is recommended that permanent traffic calming measures be introduced in the form of two low profile flat top thresholds in the same location as the two most westerly locations of the trial cushions (i.e. furthest from the intersection with Murdoch). These are intended to maintain the traffic calming effects of the cushions while mitigating the two main issues raised in feedback – the manoeuvring around the cushions and the impact experienced when driving into the cushions. Figure 1 provides a standard design detail for the ‘flat top’ threshold.



Figure 1. Example flat top threshold (note – where there is existing on-street parking, garden beds are omitted to preserve parking)

TRAFFIC VOLUME AND SPEED DATA

Traffic count and speed data collected to date are attached to this report. Speed counts are being undertaken in the first week of the 2020 School Term to avoid the school holiday period. This will allow for a comparison between speeds before and after the installation of the cushions. Further counts and a brief summary of the before and after data will be tabled at the 7 February 2020 meeting where this report is to be considered.

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Community feedback received during the trial period on the speed cushions in Bannerman Street indicated that while these measures are effective in reducing speed there is community concern around their operation. In this context, it is recommended to upgrade the trial cushions to permanent infrastructure that will achieve the speed calming benefits while addressing the concerns raised in community feedback, specifically:

- Install two (2) full width 75mm high ‘flat top’ thresholds where the two most westerly sets of cushions are located, such that drivers are not able to ‘drive around’ the speed calming device
- Raise the pedestrian crossing near to the intersection with Murdoch Street as previously resolve by Council. This is likely to have a traffic calming effect in this part of the street, and therefore remove the need to construct a threshold in the location of the third trial cushion closest to Murdoch Street, while also offering potential benefits to pedestrian safety.

Key

Pre-cycleway

Post-cycleway / Pre-speed cushions

BENNETT STREET

Count ID	1073	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
East	23	417
West	28	424

Count ID	1076	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	41	89
North	46	134

BURROWAY STREET

Count ID	1071	20-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	47	5528
North	54	6293

BERTHA ROAD

Count ID	635	17-Aug-11
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	44	67
North	46	109

Count ID	1072	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	42	54
North	46	74

GUTHRIE AVENUE

CLAUDE AVENUE

MURDOCH STREET

Count ID	1077	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	40	423
North	48	293

Count ID	1074	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	40	423
North	44	337

SHELLCOVER ROAD

BANNERMAN STREET

Count ID	1070	20-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
East	52	5341
West	28	4516

WYCOMBE ROAD

Count ID	1075	19-Jun-19
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	45	739
North	49	1364

Count ID	831	21-Oct-14
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
East	57.5	5844
West	57.6	5430

Count ID	1032	30-Jul-18
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
East	57	6185
West	57.3	5690

Count ID	1034	30-Jul-18
85th speed (km/h)	ADT	
South	41	2897
North	35	2829





Bannerman Street – Traffic Calming Plan

Drawn: 29/1/20

Not to Scale

