5.1. Current Appeals and Results - October 2021

AUTHOR: Craig Winn, Solicitor

ENDORSED BY: Shane Sullivan, Executive Manager Governance

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1. LP01 Current Matters List LEC Oct 2021 [5.1.1 3 pages]
- 2. LP01 Current Matters List Supreme Court and District Court Oct [5.1.2 1 page]
- 3. LP01 Current Matters List NCAT Oct 2021 [5.1.3 1 page]

PURPOSE:

Report on current appeal and prosecution matters.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

Attached is a list of current appeal and prosecution matters as at 30 September 2021 for Council's information.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

As at 30 September 2021, Council has incurred \$239,690 on legal fees for the 2020/21 financial year and recovered legal costs in the amount of \$21,171. The legal budget for 2021 financial year is \$ 1,500,000.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. THAT the Current Appeals and Results – October 2021 report be received.

LINK TO COMMUNITY STRATEGIC PLAN

The relationship with the Community Strategic Plan is as follows:

5. Our Civic Leadership

5.2 Council is well governed and customer focused

BACKGROUND

The Current Appeals and Prosecutions list was last reported to the Legal and Planning Committee meeting of 7 June 2021.

CONSULTATION REQUIREMENTS

Community engagement is not required.

DETAIL

The defence of Land and Environment Court appeals and the prosecution of regulatory matters represents a major ongoing expense for Council. The attached list provides a summary of each current appeal(s) and prosecution(s) (including fees incurred) as at 30 September 2021.

| Legal Proceedings | Costs (\$) | Status | Result |
|---|--------------|---------|--|
| 66 Shellcove Road, Neutral Bay Anne McCusker LEC 305102/19 | \$88,734.61 | Closed | Appeal dismissed |
| 116 Blues Point Road, McMahons Point Blues Point Hotel Property Pty Ltd and Blues Point Hotel Property No 2 Pty Ltd LEC 373973/19 | \$155,758.95 | Closed | Appeal dismissed, costs awarded to Council |
| 177-199 Pacific Hwy, North Sydney TPG Telecom Limited (formerly Vodafone Hutchison Australia Pty Limited) LEC 210569/20 | \$83,253.60 | Closed | Appeal upheld |
| 58 Cowdroy Avenue. Cammeray Renata Etherington LEC 277618/20 | \$38,882.27 | Closed` | Appeal dismissed |
| 62-64 Hayberry Street, Crows Nest Dr Eric Lim LEC 332718/20 | \$7,212.38 | Closed | Discontinued |
| 5 Bay View St, Lavender Bay Yolenda Camuglia LEC 356210/20 | \$55,361.71 | Pending | N/A |
| 18 Illiliwa St,, Cremorne Connoisseur Property Holdings Pty Ltd LEC 356211/20 | \$91,799.90 | Closed | Appeal discontinued |
| 6 John St, McMahons Point Stannards Marine Pty Ltd LEC 63136/21 | \$142,399.03 | Pending | N/A |
| 101 Blues Point Rd, McMahons Point Peter Princi Architects LEC 75725/21 | \$4,895 | Pending | N/A |

CURRENT MATTERS LIST – LAND & ENVIRONMENT COURT As at 30 September 2021

| Legal Proceedings | Costs (\$) | Status | Result |
|--|-------------|---------|----------------------------------|
| 17 Rowlison Pde, Cammeray Troy McGeachie LEC 89880/21 | \$20,438.68 | Closed | Section 34 Agreement Executed |
| 101 Blues Point Rd, McMahons Point Dreric Pty Limited LEC 101973/21 | \$10,242.95 | Pending | N/A |
| 46 Burlington St, Crows Nest Eric Young Aun Lim LEC 123657/21 | \$16,723.85 | Closed | Appeal upheld |
| 35 Kurraba Rd, Neutral Bay (20-24 Bray St, North Sydney) Loyito Pty Ltd LEC 141523/21 | \$59,307.13 | Pending | N/A |
| G01 - G07, 13 Eden St, North Sydney Myrtle 29 Pty Ltd LEC 168987/21 | \$14,040.55 | Pending | N/A |
| G01 - G06, 13 Eden St, North Sydney Myrtle 29 Pty Ltd LEC 168988/21 | \$4,838.90 | Pending | N/A |
| 233-237 Military Rd, Cremorne Clusterduck Pty Ltd LEC 199168/21 | \$3,483.70 | Pending | N/A |
| 30 Wilson Street, Cammeray Ben Turner and Rebecca Myer LEC 242732/21 | \$0 | Pending | N/A |
| 105-153 Miller Street, North Sydney IOF Custodian Pty Limited atf the 105 Miller Street North Sydney Trust LEC 245302/21 | \$0 | Pending | N/A |

| Legal Proceedings | Costs (\$) | Status | Result |
|--|------------|---------|--------|
| G01 - G06, 13 Eden St, North Sydney Myrtle 29 Pty Ltd LEC 255383/21 | \$0 | Pending | N/A |

| Legal Proceedings | Costs (\$) | Status | Result |
|---|------------|--------|---|
| Traffic Matter Matthew Norbury Williams DC 106191/20 DC 106192/20 | \$6,476.80 | Closed | Conviction and penalty affirmed. Costs awarded to Council |

CURRENT MATTERS LIST -SUPREME COURT & DISTRICT COURT As at 30 September 2021

NCAT MATTERS LIST As at 30 September 2021

| Legal Proceedings | Costs (\$) | Status | Result |
|--------------------------------------|--------------|---------|--------|
| NCAT EIG NCAT: 80016/21 | \$102,163.72 | Pending | N/A |