

10.9. Willoughby Road Shade Structures - Post Exhibition Report

| | |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| AUTHOR | Paul Yang, Engineering Project Manager |
| ENDORSED BY | Gary Parsons, Director Open Space and Infrastructure |
| ATTACHMENTS | 1. Submissions Summary Willoughby Road Shade Structures [10.9.1 - 4 pages] |
| CSP LINK | 2. Our Built Infrastructure 2.2 Vibrant public domains and villages 3. Our Innovative City 3.1 Our commercial centres are prosperous and vibrant |

PURPOSE:

The purpose of this report is to detail submissions received during the public exhibition period of the Willoughby Road Shade Structures in Crows Nest. The final recommendation is presented to Council for adoption.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

- At its meeting of 27 February 2023, Council resolved to adopt a preferred design option (Option 1C) for the upgrade of the Willoughby Road public domain. Council also resolved to undertake further consultation with business operators in relation to the potential replacement of shade structures related to outdoor dining.
- Subsequent community engagement was undertaken in relation to this matter from 27 June to 7 August 2023, in accordance Council's Community Engagement Strategy for this matter.
- A total of seven submissions were received when the consultation period closed. Over 85% of submissions supporting the proposal.

RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. THAT** Council note the submissions received for the Willoughby Road Shade Structure consultation.
- 2. THAT** Council proceeds with the Willoughby Road Shade Structure proposal as part of the Crows Nest Masterplan Implementation Project in 2023/2024.

Background

The Willoughby Road upgrade was identified as a priority project in the Crows Nest Public Domain Masterplan which was reported to Council in 2017. The Masterplan identified a vision to encourage the growth of village life in Crows Nest, along with consolidating its role as a hub for independent retail, restaurants, and entertainment on the lower North Shore.

At its meeting of 27 February 2023, Council resolved to adopt Option 1C for Willoughby Road as the preferred option, with inclusion of modified design elements to ensure the streetscape design is consistent with Hume Street Park.

It was also resolved that Council undertake further consultation with business operators on Willoughby Road regarding the potential replacement of umbrellas with 'alfresco' shade structures.

Council has reviewed the shade options and is proposing to replace existing umbrellas that are at the end of their life with new umbrellas that will maintain the standard of Crows Nest's main street.

The umbrellas on Willoughby Road, between Burlington and Albany Streets, will be funded from the Crows Nest Mainstreet levy and maintained by Council.

Report

A total of seven submissions were received with 85% supporting the proposal.

A sample of reasons given in support of the project is provided below:

I support the proposal to refresh the appearance and attractiveness of Willoughby Road and the financing of to by way of payment from the Crows Nest Streetscape Levy.

The new items seem very much in keeping with current 'feel' of the area.

I agree that the suggest shade structure will be a positive addition to Willoughby Road.

There was no opposition to the proposal, however feedback about the limited choice of umbrella options was received.

Public exhibition period

The 42-day public exhibition period was held from 27 June to 7 August 2023 in accordance with the Community engagement strategy for Willoughby Road Streetscape Upgrade Stage 2.

Inform Reach

The following summary details the methods used to promote the trial park and their reach:

- web page - 332 page visits, including:
 - o 21 views of the shade layout map
 - o 12 views of the FAQs document
- Council's eNewsletters, including:
 - Council eNews, July 2023 - 1468 reach, 50.8% (746) opened, 30 clicks
 - Council eNews, August 2023 - 1507 reach, 58% (877) opened, 9 clicks
 - Business eNews, July 2023 - 945 reach, 36% (341) opened, 3 clicks
 - Business eNews, August 2023 – 951 reach, 43.22% (411) opened, 8 clicks
 - Precinct eNews, 6 issues June to August 2023 (weekly) - 166 subscribers, 46% average opened, 32 clicks total
- Civic Park and Stanton Library 'Your Say' noticeboards

1.2 Online Feedback Form

The secondary method for feedback was an online feedback form hosted on the Your Say site. There were seven responses, with majority support for the shade structures.

Face to face engagement was also conducted, with Council representatives hosting an onsite meeting at The Crows Nest Centre on Tuesday 4 July 2023. Five business representatives attended, plus one local resident, and one precinct member.

Submissions

Submissions were from a range of stakeholders including local business operators, residents, and precinct committee members.

The following table summarises the key feedback received in relation to the proposal and Council's action to the issues raised:

| Key Issue | Council Response |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Material heat resistance | Concern around heater placement material isn't damaged. <i>Request to provide guidelines around fixing heaters to the structure for both radial and panel heating</i> |
| Fixing lights | Experience of drilling into structure to place lights has caused rusting of structure in the past. <i>Request for brackets to be placed on the structures so that add-ons (e.g., heaters and lights) can be placed without having to drill into the structure's frame will be considered.</i> |
| Communications | Communication on the project has been poor so far and needs to improve. Only found out about the meeting by chance, while others found out an hour prior, and there was confusion in relation to work start time and location of the meeting. <i>Noted. A contact list of local businesses and residents has been created to provide regular updates.</i> |

| Key Issue | Council Response |
|------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Bird hinderers | Requested that bird deterrents be placed on light poles so that birds do not cause issues on the streets. Gave example of effective use at Optus in Macquarie Park. <i>Acoustic bird deterrents have been linked to noise complaints and will not be installed due to adjacent residences; however, bird spikes can be investigated to deter roosting birds</i> |
| Freeze on charge | With many operators not being the owner, a request to freeze outdoor dining fees during the construction period was requested to compensate for disruptions. <i>Noted – will be investigated</i> |
| Pavements | The current pavement around Woolworths is too slippery. Request to use more cause paving like at Barrangaroo to prevent slip hazards. <i>Noted – will be investigated</i> |
| Drainage | Umbrellas at Burwood have drainage/guttering around the structure which would be a beneficial addition for umbrellas installed on Willoughby Road. <i>Drainage and guttering are Included in the proposal.</i> |

Options

Council has the following options in relation to this matter:

1. Do nothing/take no action.
2. Install 'non retractable' shade structure as presented at the Council meeting on the 27 February 2032.
3. Install standard shade structures.

These options are assessed in the table below.

| Option | Finance/Resourcing | Risk/Opportunity | Consultation |
|---------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | Do nothing | Does not address community's concern about ageing streetscape umbrellas | Consultation from 2022 identified the need to refresh the streetscape including the 'mouldy' umbrellas |
| 2. | Original option \$1M | Custom shade structure from interstate supplier quoted at \$1,000,000 which exceeded the allocated budget | Concept design option was presented 27 February 2023 however exceeded the budget allocation and is not recommended |
| 3 | Recommended Option \$380K | Standard shade structure from local supplier quoted at \$380,399 which was within the budget allocation | Matches existing umbrellas installed on Willoughby Road, supported by business operators and residents in Crows Nest |

Option 3, is recommended for the following reasons:

- The standard shade structure option 3 is under the \$400,000 budget allocation and is financially sustainable when considering long term replacement cost funded from the Crows Nest mainstreet levy which generates approximately \$300,000 p.a.
- The standard shade structure can be sourced from supplier 'Alfresco Shade' based in Riverstone, Sydney, and can provide warranty support and ongoing maintenance.
- Option 3 is supported by business operators and residents as it matches the existing style of umbrellas in Willoughby Road.

Consultation requirements

Community engagement will be undertaken in accordance with Council's Community Engagement Protocol.

Financial/Resource Implications

The 'alfresco' shade structures have been quoted at \$380,399 ex.-GST and can be funded from the Crows Nest Mainstreet Levy which generates approximately \$300,000 per annum. It should be noted that the levy has been carried over for two financial years, and sufficient funds are available.

Other Mainstreet costs

Ongoing maintenance of the shade structures will become the responsibility of Council. This could be funded from the Mainstreet Levy, which will provide a solution to the inconsistent look and cleaning of privately owned umbrellas currently on Willoughby Road.

Willoughby Road Shade Structures Summary of submissions received during the public exhibition period (Exhibition Period 27 June – 7 August 2023)

The following criteria are used to analyse all submissions received, and to determine whether or not the plan would be amended:

1. The Willoughby Road Shade Structures design **would be** amended if issues raised in the submission:
 - a provided additional information of relevance.
 - b indicated or clarified a change in government legislation, Council's commitment or management policy.
 - c proposed strategies that would better achieve or assist with Council's objectives.
 - d was an alternate viewpoint received on the topic and is considered a better option than that proposed or;
 - e indicated omissions, inaccuracies or a lack of clarity.

2. The Willoughby Road Shade Structures design **would not be** amended if the issues raised in the submission:
 - a addressed issues beyond the scope of the proposal.
 - b was already in the proposal or will be considered during the development of a subordinate plan (prepared by Council).
 - c offered an open statement, or no change was sought.
 - d clearly supported the proposal.
 - e was an alternate viewpoint received on the topic but the recommendation was still considered the best option.
 - f was based on incorrect information.
 - g contributed options that are not possible (generally due to some aspect of existing legislation or government policy) or; involved details that are not appropriate or necessary for inclusion in a document aimed at providing a strategic community direction over the long term.

| No. | Name and Address | Key Points Raised | Criteria |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| 1 | Name and address withheld Doug Wilson 402 26 Clarke St CROWS NEST ECM 9708891 | Bit harsh to pick the style of umbrella and impose that on all the merchants who have spent on high quality ones with heaters, drop walls etc You need to account for the \$ they have spent already on those and provide options for like for like if you're mandating something | 2b |
| 2 | Name and address withheld Julie Spencer Plunkett Street NAREMBURN janspencer8@hotmail.com ECM 9708891 | Please include weather protection, more seating, and pavements that will remain flat, even without any tripping hazards. Please repair all pavements that are uneven. | 2b |
| 3. | Name and address withheld Elaine Elliott 78a Albany Street CROWS NEST eelliott@bigpond.net.au ECM 9708891 | I wish to re-submit the comments I made in October 2022. Although I have read Council's documents and listened to the recording of the public meeting in November 2022, I remain puzzled as to why NO consideration is being made for public dining in cold and wet weather. I consider this to be VERY important. I therefore enclose my previous comments as they appear to have been overlooked or ignored: * What provisions and consideration are being made for shelter in the outdoor eating places for cold weather and wet weather and winter dining – that is, all-weather dining? At the moment it is possible to eat out with the protection of the enclosed areas using heavy plastic, or similar material to shield the diners from the elements. Heaters are also used on cold nights which add to the comfort of diners. All I can see in the concept drawings and photos are provisions for plenty of sun umbrellas, and the photographs portraying sunny weather. As you will be well aware, this is not always the case!! I searched the PDFs for words like or or and none of these options produced any results. It would appear that no consideration has been given to continue the ability of diners to eat out in protected, warm, and dry conditions under all weather conditions. This, to me, is what makes the restaurant-strip of Willoughby Road so attractive and practical. ***** If All-Weather dining provisions are not included in the plans for the Willoughby Road upgrade, I fear that the current vibrant night life in Willoughby Road will fade away. No one wants to eat out when they are cold or when the rain is blowing in on them. The current concept diagrams do not cater for all-weather protection for diners. | 2a |

| No. | Name and Address | Key Points Raised | Criteria |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| 4. | Name and address withheld John Hancox 4 56 Shirley Road WOLLSTONCRAFT johnhancox@me.com ECM 9708891 | There is not much here on which to comment (no designs or colours and maintenance guidelines) which will obviously be subject to a review with the businesses in the area. It appears there may 60 businesses affected by this proposal. Some of those businesses may have objections given their existing shade structures are new.. Apart from those comments, I support the proposal to refresh the appearance and attractiveness of Willoughby Road and the financing of to by way of payment from the Crows Nest Streetscape Levy (on all businesses within the designated Streetscape area). | 2d |
| 5 | Name and address withheld Adrienne McClymont 5 3 Belmont Ave WOLLSTONCRAFT scipiorghese@yahoo.com.au ECM 9708891 | The new items seem very much in keeping with current 'feel' of the area. | 2d |
| 6 | Name and address withheld Joy Heads 1 36 Milner Crescent WOLLSTONCRAFT joyheads@iinet.net.au ECM 9708891 | I agree that the suggest shade structure will be a positive addition to Willoughby Road | 2d |

| No. | Name and Address | Key Points Raised | Criteria |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| 7 | Name and address withheld Dianne Kennedy 14 Carlyle Street WOLLSTONCRAFT Dmkdezigner100@gmail.com ECM 9708891 | My comment is based on my observations of the state of existing canvas type umbrellas. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the main criticisms is that the umbrella material becomes visually dirty and stained quite quickly because it is of light-coloured material. Leaf litter from adjacent trees, combined with the constant fallout from traffic (dust & dirt constantly circulating in the air) ultimately settles onto these umbrella tops. This build-up in the past has enabled mould to grow quite quickly, especially after lengthy periods of wet weather. To eliminate this problem and at the same time increase the period of time before replacement becomes necessary, while at the also ensuring a uniform well-maintained appearance for the whole streetscape, I suggest Council specify a darker material shade for these umbrella tops (ie royal blue, which is a popular, durable colour used for boating canvas covers exposed to harsh weather conditions). • The specifications for the optional perspex covers should also be issued by Council to ensure uniformity. • The businesses licensed for these additional table spaces should be subject to agreed basic hygiene guidelines, as specified by Council, to maintain the cleanliness of their outdoor floor areas at close of business each day. (These semi-enclosed areas capture rubbish build-up such as debris blown in from the street, as well as litter left behind by their patrons who use these areas). I certainly support the proposal to refresh the appearance and attractiveness of Willoughby Road and that this should be financed from the Crows Nest Streetscape Levy (on all businesses within the designated Streetscape area). | 2b |